

und Wien', in which the author successfully demonstrates not only the predominant role that Meyerbeer played at opera houses in the two cities, but also the mechanisms that led to the decline of enthusiasm for the composer and his works in the 1920s. Sirker neatly shows how—for 1920s Berlin—Meyerbeer was squeezed from both sides: the progressive Left saw him as a monarchist Prussian while the nationalist Right saw him as a foreigner or 'other', with the clear connotations for the following decade that are inescapable. Sirker's chapter unpacks this opposition delightfully, and is a major contribution towards understanding the demise of Meyerbeer's popularity in the city of his birth.

This is an interesting collection of essays, as much for the way in which Meyerbeer is constructed as for the detail of the individual contributions, which vary enormously in quality. Here we find Meyerbeer being promoted as a composer in the same way as Wagner or Verdi, being moved away from the context in which he functioned and aestheticized in the same way as other, major, figures. It is not clear that Meyerbeer is best served by this type of treatment; understanding the past is key to understanding why a composer could be so feted in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and so vilified later. And an understanding of the past that reinscribes Meyerbeer into a narrative of composers and works, rather than into analysis of the world in which he functioned, risks simply pitting the composer against Verdi and Wagner in an axiological contest that will be played out with early twenty-first century rules; under such circumstances, Meyerbeer can only lose, and the reasons for his decline in the third and fourth decades of the twentieth century will remain unchallenged.

MARK EVERIST

University of Southampton

doi:10.1093/ml/gct030

Annotated Catalogue of Chopin's First Editions. By Christophe Grabowski and John Rink. pp. lxxxiv + 909. (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2010, £130. ISBN 978 0 521 81917 6.)

This annotated catalogue of first editions is unique in the field of music publishing, and is especially appropriate for the particular case that Chopin's oeuvre represents. Having settled down in Paris, Chopin had his works, from Opus 6 onwards, released simultaneously in France, in the German states, and in England, though without paying the same personal atten-

tion to the progress of each respective publication. Chopin's musical heritage thus came to us in three first editions. The problem is well known, and clearly summarized by the authors (pp. xxi–xxiii). They state modestly (p. ix) that it has taken ten years of research to arrive at this authoritative result, but in reality this *Annotated Catalogue* is the culmination of about twenty years of preparation and the gathering of materials internationally (from sixty institutions and five private collections across eleven countries), punctuated by Christophe Grabowski's doctoral thesis in 1992, and a succession of major studies produced by the authors.

The book lists and describes, with a meticulousness that will be discussed below: (a) the first editions that appeared during Chopin's lifetime, (b) those that were released between 1850 and 1878, and (c) the successive reprints of these editions until their disappearance from the market. The 4,830 or so copies that have been inventoried represent approximately 1,552 distinct impressions—'most of which could plausibly be described as "Chopin first editions" in one sense. The meaning of "first" needs to be qualified, however: as the "Historical overview" explains, multiple impressions of many scores were successively brought out, thus producing a vast quantity of "first editions" that vary in content and relative significance. Numerous difficulties arise in identifying and classifying this material, requiring the systematic application of well-defined criteria so that the distinctive features and status of each impression can be determined and assessed' (p. ix).

The *Annotated Catalogue* opens with two introductions: a historical survey, 'Chopin's first editions: historical overview' (pp. xxi–lxi), and an 'Introduction to the *Annotated Catalogue*' (pp. lxiii–lxxxiv). The historical overview, erudite yet lucid, recounts the legal context of music publishing in the countries where Chopin released his works (pp. xxi–xxiii); lays out the general characteristics of the first editions (pp. xxiv–xxxv); physical properties, printing methods, aspects of the title pages, covers, and musical modifications—or lack of them—occurring over the course of successive impressions); and presents a near-exhaustive study of Chopin's French, German/Austrian, English, and Polish editors, and the dating of their respective editions (pp. xxxvi–lxi; Italian editors are mentioned briefly on pp. lx–lxi).

The introduction proper sets out the principles that guided the classification, the description, and the dating, of thousands of scores that had, until now, been stuck in an impasse

created by previous, ill-informed approaches. It begins with an explanation (pp. lxiii–lxv) of the classificatory criteria that have been implemented and, in particular, defines what will constitute cognate impressions for the purposes of the volume: ‘After prolonged reflection, we have therefore decided to classify together those scores with the following common characteristics: (1) identical text on the title page; (2) identical physical contents; (3) identical means of production; (4) identical music text and extra-musical elements such as caption titles, sub-captions, footlines, etc.’ (p. lxiv).

The authors subsequently detail the means they use in the catalogue to describe the scores as closely as possible, and to attribute them to one impression or another (pp. lxv–lxxv): the meticulous transcription of the title page and of all the other textual elements of a score (described as ‘quasi-facsimile transcriptions’: p. lxvii n. 14), the contents, the criteria for dating, and the identification of the textual and musical modifications that make it possible to distinguish between different impressions. For this last point, most importantly, the authors have come up with a very simple solution, by indicating several ‘distinguishing musical features’ (abbreviated as ‘DMF’). Finally, each catalogue entry is given a unique code (pp. lxvi–lxvii): thus ‘23–1a-B&H’ designates the second impression of the first edition of the *Ballade* op. 23 issued by Breitkopf and Härtel (the first impression does not require a letter to identify it). For each impression, the authors provide locations, shelfmarks, and specific descriptions for copies that they have examined personally. To avoid unnecessary repetition the reader is frequently referred back to preceding entries for descriptive details that have remained unchanged in successive impressions. This introduction concludes with information on the dating of the first editions—completing the information given in the historical overview—and with a glossary of the technical terms used (pp. lxxviii–lxxxiv).

Then comes the catalogue itself, 583 pages strong, together with eighty-five pages or so of complementary appendices, and illustrated with 222 full-page plates (pp. 587–808) reproducing as many title pages, most often from the first impression (the uniform and blurry reproduction, which hinders the already difficult legibility of certain lines, is regrettable). For each work, the catalogue provides several pages of meticulous description of the known impressions of the first French, German, English, and Polish editions and of their subsequent reprints until they disappeared

from the market. The elements are always given in the same order and in the same very clear layout on the page: code, description in quasi-facsimile, ‘Contents’, ‘Caption title’, ‘Sub-caption’, ‘Footline’, ‘Comments’, ‘Modifications’, ‘Errors’, ‘Distinguishing Musical Features’ [‘DMF’], ‘Additional Distinguishing Features’ [‘ADF’], and ‘Copies’. The ‘DMF’ section allows impressions that contain modifications of the musical text to be immediately located and distinguished from those that contain only typographical differences.

Four appendices follow. Appendix I (pp. 811–32), devoted to orchestral parts, is particularly important, as, until now, these have never been inventoried or systematically described. (Though see John Rink, *Chopin: The Piano Concertos* (Cambridge, 1997), and his new *Urtext* edition of the two concertos (see below, *The Complete Chopin*), as well as Halina Goldberg, ‘Chamber Arrangements of Chopin’s Concert Works’, *Journal of Musicology*, 19 (2002), 39–84.) This survey will be of invaluable assistance for research in this area. Appendix II (pp. 833–58) and Appendix III (pp. 859–95), devoted to series title pages and to pages of advertisements listing works by Chopin and/or other composers published by the same editor, bring together hitherto unstudied documents that at first sight seem marginal and uninteresting; the use to which the authors put these documents throughout the catalogue, however, demonstrates the importance that they hold for classifying and dating the impressions that contain such pages. Appendix IV (pp. 896–905) is an index of libraries and private collections considered in the catalogue. The volume ends with a list of several works not included in the catalogue—either because they appeared after 1878 or because their authenticity is uncertain (p. 906)—and with a brief bibliography (pp. 907–9).

As with all specialized scientific tools, the *Annotated Catalogue* expects readers who wish to make the best use of it to linger over the essential explanatory sections, summarized above, before delving into the body of the catalogue. The book then allows multiple—one would be tempted to say inexhaustible—lessons to be drawn from it. The sheer bulk of new information brought forward for each opus of editions, of successive impressions and their dating, of distribution, is impressive. The degree of differentiation achieved in the distinction of the impressions, and the reliability of the results obtained are such that the intrinsic musical and documentary value of each example already known in the literature and cited in the

Annotated Catalogue is far better defined than ever before. Currently in progress, the new *Urtext* edition of Chopin's oeuvre has, since its inception, benefitted greatly from this research (*The Complete Chopin: A New Critical Edition*, ed. John Rink, Jim Samson, Jean-Jacques Eigeldinger, and Christophe Grabowski (London: Peters Edition, 2004–)). Second, any user with a copy of a so-called 'first' edition to hand will find here everything required to attribute their copy to an impression that has already been described, or, failing that, to situate it correctly in the sequence of known impressions. Third, the great care that the authors have taken in dating the described impressions is commendable: the dates are not offered systematically, but rather on a case-by-case basis, according to the criteria of the research, and are often preceded by a 'c', 'before', 'after', or extended in the form of a range of dates, thus avoiding hasty conclusions.

A preliminary examination of all the data supplied by the catalogue allows several interesting observations. The works published by Chopin during his lifetime (Opp. 1–3, 5–65, and several works without opus numbers) today amount to approximately 1,330 different impressions. The German impressions are the most numerous (595), followed by the English (430), then the French (305); but it is the English impressions that most often present *DMF* (123 concerning 59 works), followed by the German (99 concerning 51 works) and then the French (38 concerning 34 works). It is thus the French editions that present the least number of impressions in total, and the least number of impressions containing modifications of the musical text, but these modifications were made during Chopin's lifetime, while in the German and English editions the majority of modifications were made posthumously (p. xxxiv). Moreover, the musical texts of approximately thirty-five works presented no modifications at all in their French editions during Chopin's lifetime (p. xxxiv and Table 1). Knowing that Chopin lived in Paris in the autumn of 1831 until his death, and that the French editions of his works—all Parisian—were the only ones for which he followed the publication process from start to finish, and even beyond the original impression, it was therefore normal to privilege the French edition as a benchmark; this choice now constitutes one of the pillars of the new Peters *Urtext* edition ('Notes on Editorial Method and Practice', p. 61 of the volume devoted to the *Préludes*).

In addition to its natural extension in *The Complete Chopin*, the *Annotated Catalogue* has

developed in parallel with two vast projects carried out by a team under the direction of John Rink. *Chopin's First Editions Online [CFEO]* <www.cfeo.org.uk> has placed online complete copies of the first impressions of almost all of Chopin's first editions, accompanied by an important commentary, particularly for the extensive section entitled 'Analysis of printed sources and the publication process'. And the *Online Chopin Variorum Edition [OCVE]* <www.ocve.org.uk>, still under development, presents, for selected works (*Ballades*, *Scherzi*, *Préludes*, *Fantaisie*, *Polonaise-Fantaisie*), a vast array of original sources—both manuscript and printed—that 'can be manipulated in a wide variety of ways, allowing new insights to be gained through extraction, comparison, juxtaposition and collation'.

Faced with an enterprise—and a success—of this scale, it would be unseemly to draw attention to inaccuracies or typographic errors, most often trifles that will certainly be rectified in the online version that the authors and the editor are currently preparing, and that will be accessible from the start of 2014. At most, one might regret the decision, in the section headed 'Copies', not to cite systematically the scores from van Hoboken's and Platzman's former collections (held in the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Vienna and the University of Chicago Library respectively), but only those that 'either can be found nowhere else or are otherwise rare' (p. ix n. 2). The catalogue of the van Hoboken collection is well known (Karin Breitner and Thomas Leibnitz, *Katalog der Sammlung Anthony van Hoboken in der Musiksammlung der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek*, iv: *Johannes Brahms, Frédéric Chopin* (Tutzing, 1986)), but frequently does not allow the identification of the exact impression to which its copies belong. The scores from the Platzman collection are online <chopin.lib.uchicago.edu/chopin-catalog>, a fact that would have been worth indicating each time one of the scores was mentioned, as the *Annotated Catalogue* will now be the main source of reference. But, given the scale of the work, this is only a minor detail, which an online version will easily remedy.

From now on, it is up to the scientific community as a whole to prevent the result of such efforts from stagnating. Every library, every collection, may hold impressions of first editions that have not yet been listed and that potentially contain precious information. The *Annotated Catalogue* permits all users to classify these impressions quickly, easily, and correctly by comparing them with the impressions that

have already been described. It is to be hoped that many librarians and curators of collections that have not been inventoried in this catalogue will make their contribution by reporting all new information to the authors of this book.

BERTRAND JAEGER, trans. Delphine Mordey
Universität Basel
doi:10.1093/ml/gct031

Hans von Bülow: A Life for Music. By Kenneth Birkin. pp. xvii + 715. (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2011, £95. ISBN 978-1-10700-586-0.)

'Hans von Bülow is known to posterity as the man whose wife left him for Richard Wagner; and as the first conductor of *Tristan* and *Die Meistersinger*. But to reduce him to a footnote of Wagnerian biography does scant justice to the memory of one whose influence on nineteenth- and twentieth-century musical performance and practice was seminal' (p. ix). Hans von Bülow (1830–94) came from an ancient Prussian family that could be traced back as far as the thirteenth century. He was initially destined for a legal career, but his evident musical talent eventually persuaded his reluctant father to allow him to join Liszt at Weimar, where he became a passionate advocate of the ideas of the New German School rapidly gaining currency around Liszt and Wagner. It was at Weimar that he first came to the attention of Richard Wagner, who recognized in the young Hans a musician of remarkable gifts who might be useful to the Wagnerian cause. The story of how Bülow was ultimately drawn within Wagner's orbit, first as arranger of the vocal score and then conductor of *Tristan* (1865) and of *Die Meistersinger* (1868), while Wagner was conducting an affair with Bülow's wife Cosima, is the stuff of musical legend and has often been told. The later but equally significant part of Bülow's career is less well known: after the break with Wagner in 1869 he began a new career as a touring piano virtuoso and ultimately became the model of the first 'star' conductor in the modern sense of the term who set new standards of orchestral performance and was a major figure in the development of European concert life and the emergence of the Western canon.

In *Hans von Bülow: A Life for Music*, Kenneth Birkin has produced a work of formidable scholarship that draws on a wide range of documentary evidence to assess Bülow's career at the centre of nineteenth-century musical life. Bülow could have become a significant com-

poser: his early orchestral fantasy *Nirvana* (1854) was warmly praised by both Liszt and Wagner: 'I have to say, it's masterly; in my opinion, after this, you could do anything at all. . . . When I was your age I simply couldn't have begun to write anything like it' (p. 79). There are also striking similarities between the music of *Nirvana* and the chromatic material of *Tristan*. Bülow's devotion to Wagner, however, acted as a bar to the development of his own powers as a composer (p. 119), and it is as a re-creative rather than as a creative artist that he strides across the later nineteenth-century musical stage like a colossus.

Birkin gives a detailed account of Bülow's rigorous pianistic training under Liszt's tutelage as a member of the Weimar school and of his early activities as a piano pedagogue. The breadth and depth of his direct experience of Liszt as conductor and rehearsaler was crucial in the formation of his later powers as an orchestral trainer. Bülow's experience of the premiere of *Lohengrin* on 28 August 1850 under Liszt's direction was seminal in his growing admiration of Wagner. Birkin is also right to remind the reader of the importance of Berlioz in Weimar. Although Weimar was the powerhouse of the New German School it was by no means restricted to German music. The Berlioz festival in November 1852 was a landmark in the French composer's career and in the young Hans von Bülow he had gained 'a valuable artistic ally' (p. 62). Accounts of Bülow's early career as a virtuoso concert artist show just how wide a repertory he had built up by an early age, although critical acclaim was by no means consistent: the critic attending his first recital in Vienna described the Beethoven Sonata (Op. 101) as 'lacking in tonal beauty, flow and objectivity' (p. 66). Another aspect of his famously prickly personality that was to dog him in his later career also becomes apparent in accounts of his early performances: sensitivity to criticism.

Bülow's years in Berlin (1855–64) as piano pedagogue and artistic rebel are rightly given prominence in Birkin's narrative. This period was not only notable for extensive teaching activities but crucial to his artistic development: he not only forged new standards of pianistic delivery through such tasks as giving the first public performance of Liszt's B minor Sonata (22 January 1857) but by means of his early performances as a conductor began to define the role of the non-creative executive in the act of performance. Bülow's Wagner years (1864–9), during which he directed the first performances of *Tristan und Isolde* (10 June 1865) and *Die Meis-*