In his article ‘. . . so beautiful that I was almost beside myself: Vivaldi and the Basel Collegium Musicum’ (Early Music, xxxviii/1 (2010), pp.113–17), Robert Kintzel invites further investigation into Vivaldi reception in Switzerland, a suggestion I am happy to follow. I would like to add a few remarks to Kintzel’s stimulating contribution, and propose an identification for the Vivaldi concerto mentioned in the Winterthur inventory. The so-called *Wappenbuch* (Book of coat-of-arms) of the Musikkollegium Winterthur (deposited in the Studienbibliothek Winterthur, Dep MK 303, *olim* 114) gathers together several documents relevant to the history of this remarkable institution, which was founded in 1629 and is still in existence today (*illus.1*). It opens with a lengthy introduction, a copy of the statutes in the new version from 1660 and a list of the associates from the foundation of the music society (ff.4r–18r; the list was continued until 1800). The most immediately appealing part of the volume are the coats-of-arms of the associates from 1629 to the 1840s, drawn in brilliant colours (ff.88r–214r). But what interests us here are two inventories of the Collegium’s music library. The first was started in 1660, together with the first entries in the book (ff.23r–46v). The second, superseding the older one, was started around 1722 and updated until 1764 (ff.48r–50v). The *terminus ante quem* can be gleaned from an account book of 1753–1809: the cost of binding the very last entry in the inventory, symphonies by Abel and Agrell under number 69, was entered there in September 1764.¹

Despite their description by Karl Nef in 1897 and a preliminary listing of all entries by Max Fehr in 1929,² the two inventories have so far received little scholarly attention. One reason lies surely in the fact that this repertory—more than 100 items between the two inventories—is almost completely lost. A collection by Johann Crüger of psalms in Lobwasser’s ubiquitous German translation³ is the only surviving title among all those mentioned in the *Wappenbuch*. Why did it survive? In the inventory it is mentioned as belonging, already by the 17th century, to the ‘Bürgerliche Bibliothec’, thus not strictly speaking to the Collegium Musicum itself. Moreover, we may suppose that the Lobwasser psalms were the kind of repertory that could still be in use after the passage of one century, in the library of a Protestant town.

Apart from this particular case, the earliest preserved source from the Collegium Musicum’s collection are probably the symphonies op.13 by Carl Stamitz,⁴ which were bought in 1778 for 13 thaler, plus an additional thaler for binding,⁵ one year after their publication in London. It cannot be a simple coincidence that the most recent inventory entry and the most ancient preserved item are less than ten years apart. The Zurich music society ‘auf der Chorherrenstube’ had radically renewed its repertory only a few years earlier. An unspecified quantity of ‘old music with no practical use’ was sold in May 1763 for 7 Gulden and 26 Schilling (‘alte unbrauchbare Music’).⁶ The Winterthur Collegium Musicum was therefore following a widespread trend when, as Robert Kintzel recalled, 274 pounds of ‘old music’ were sold in 1786 at the price of one shilling a pound.⁷ The decision was taken in the assembly of 12 October 1785, where the sale price

---

¹ observation

Claudio Bacciagaluppi

More on Vivaldi in Switzerland
1 ‘Wappenbuch’ of the Musikkollegium Winterthur, title-page (Studienbibliothek Winterthur, Dep mk 303, f.3r. Courtesy of the Musikkollegium Winterthur)
was also determined: ‘1785 den 12 8bris. wurde auch von samtlichen Herren alle alte, unvollkome, etc. Music das Pfund à 1 S. zu verkaufen erkannt’. It was a necessary passage in the process of transforming a private academy into a music society organizing up-to-date public concerts. It was probably on this occasion that the manuscript of Vivaldi’s concerto changed ownership and passed out of the historical record.

Fortunately for us, the musical repertory of the Collegia Musica did not remain confined in one library. Once it arrived north of the Alps, fine Italian music was eagerly borrowed and copied, and spread over the entire German-speaking part of Switzerland (illus.2 shows a Winterthur rehearsal or performance in progress). Vivaldi’s concerto is listed in the Winterthur inventory of 1722–64 as number 50, ‘Anthonij Vivaldj Concert, in folio. 6 theill’—that is, in six partbooks. Let us compare the Vivaldi entry in Winterthur with an entry in the inventory of the collection of the Benedictine convent of Muri.9 This inventory was drawn up in 1848, when the convent was closed and its music collection dispersed. The authorities of Canton Aargau, understandably keen on making the most of the belongings of the former monasteries, distributed the music from Muri, together with the music coming from the Cistercian house of Wettingen, among 20 parish churches in the district, the cantonal library and the Lehrerseminar. The parish church of Muri village received ‘Vivaldi, Ant. Concert. (sehr alt) [very old]’, listed as item number 1047. In a previous list, recording only the Benedictine sources and also their former location in the monastery, the Vivaldi concerto is entered as number 36 of a group of sundry works kept ‘by the great organ’. It is listed after an anonymous four-voice Mass with organ accompaniment, also labelled ‘very old’, and it precedes two other anonymous concertos for violin and ‘small orchestra’. After a more recent Mass by (Lorenzo) Pelli two entries follow that sound like the titles of German prints from the 17th century: ‘Nardus musica in Horto aromatum’ and ‘Statuae amoris’, in 13 and 15 partbooks respectively. No copy of a print with these titles is known by me to have survived. Vivaldi’s concerto, in any case, was kept in 1848 with a small group of instrumental works among other more or less obsolete pieces of music.

There is one further issue I wish to address, although in this context I can only be very brief. The identification of the Vivaldi concerto in Winterthur with the one in Muri may raise doubt on a question of principle. While Muri was a Benedictine convent, the Winterthur Collegium Musicum was a society of well-to-do Protestant laymen. Is the exchange of music scores between these institutions of opposed confessional creed a plausible hypothesis? The answer is definitely yes. In the chequered religious landscape of modern Switzerland, pragmatism often encouraged exchanges of all kinds between the confessions in the name of a common interest—in this case, for the sake of good music.10 I am aware of no further coincidences between the Winterthur inventory from 1722–64 and the inventory of Muri from 1848. However, if I cannot pinpoint a case of direct transmission of music manuscripts, a certain overlapping of printed repertory can be observed between the Winterthur inventory and two 17th-century inventories of Catholic religious institutions from the region around Lucerne: the 1660 inventory of the Cistercian monastery of St Urban11 and the 1696 inventory of the Chorherrenstift in Beromünster.12 In common with the Winterthur music library, the Cistercians in St Urban once had Gallus Dressler’s Opus sacrarum cantionum,13 Johann Philipp’s Missae14 and Hieronymus Praetorius’s Magnificat . . . cum Motetis aliquot.15 The Beromünster canons in turn had Francesco Bagatti’s Motetti, messa, e salmi op.5,16 Giovanni Battista Bassani’s Acroama Missale,17 Isabella Leonarda’s Motetti a quatro voci op.10,18 and Valentin Molitor’s Epicinion Marianum.19

To be sure, the item from the monastery of Muri might still have been another Vivaldi work, but let us first examine yet another inventory. In 1812, the Musikgesellschaften ‘der mehreren Stadt’ and ‘auf dem Musiksaal’, the two music societies of the city of Zurich, decided to merge and founded the ‘Allgemeine Musikgesellschaft’, which is still active today. Leonhard Ziegler, the librarian of the new association, started compiling a catalogue of the music collection in 1813. His first draft lists some 800 items.20 The final catalogue, from 1814, was updated until after 1828, with the addition of some 350 items.21 But already before 1812 one of the original music societies owned at least one concerto by Vivaldi. This was listed by Ziegler as number

EARLY MUSIC NOVEMBER 2011 599
2 Tile on the oven from the Musikkollegium Winterthur music room by Hans Heinrich Pfau and David Sulzer, 1705 (Winterthur, Museum Lindengut, Inv. no.581. Courtesy of the Musikkollegium Winterthur)
3 Antonio Vivaldi, Violin Concerto RV275, first page of tutti violin part (Zentralbibliothek Zurich, AMG XIII 1072 & a–e)
Vivaldi (Antonio) Concerto à 3 Violini, Alto Viola, Violoncello e Organa. Mscpt’, amongst the ‘sundry pieces’ (‘vermischte Stücke’). This manuscript is preserved in the Allgemeine Musikgesellschaft collection of the Zurich Central Library. The source (for the violin concerto in E minor, rv275, see illus.3) is in six parts—just like the lost source in Winterthur—and is written by a German-speaking copyist. Its title-page (the first page of the solo violin part) displays some unusual features: ‘Concerto XXIV. / a 6. / 3 Violini. / 1 Alto viola / 1 Violoncello / ed / Organo. / Il Sig.r Antonio Vivaldi di Parma’. Why is Vivaldi described as from Parma? Could it refer to the provenance not of the composer but of the copyist’s exemplar? If this is the case, the Zurich source would not be derived from the Amsterdam print where the concerto was first published (as no.12 in the miscellaneous Concerti a Cinque), but from an Italian manuscript copy. The work’s numbering as ‘concerto 24’ is also somewhat puzzling, but can be easily explained. A series of other concertos in the AMG collection exhibits similar numbers, and all are in fact copied by the same hand. Number 17 is a concerto in C major by Albinoni;23 no.18, a concerto in D major by Alberti;24 no.22, a concerto in D major by ‘Sig.r Bepusch’;25 and no.23 another concerto by Vivaldi (G minor, rv316a).26 Unfortunately, there is no trace of the first 16. There seems to have been another numbering for symphonies in the same group of manuscripts. A symphony in D major by ‘Sig.r Bornozini’ (Bononcini), found on the back of the parts for the concerto by Pepusch,27 is titled ‘II. Sinfonia’. To my knowledge, however, there are no further similar numberings to be found in AMG sources.

The Zurich collection preserves two concertos by Vivaldi, while the inventories in Muri and in Winterthur mention only one. This difference, in my opinion, might be just apparent. It is a good example of the caution needed in interpreting entries from historical inventories, which are very often incomplete or simply follow a different logic from our own. The cataloguing habits of Leonhard Ziegler provide a key to explain this issue. Curiously, Ziegler does not mention in his catalogue the G minor concerto by Vivaldi. While he correctly lists the works by Alberti (as his no.256) and Bononcini (no.228), he also apparently omits Albinoni’s and Pepusch’s concertos. My guess is that he left out Pepusch because he already had entered Bononcini, its companion piece. And under Alberti’s name he mentions together with the concerto in D major a second one in C major—possibly Albinoni’s otherwise forgotten work. Similarly, he may have entered just one title by Vivaldi, if we conjecture that the two concertos were kept together in the same folder. The adjoining numbers of the Vivaldi concertos—nos.23 and 24—and of Albinoni and Alberti—nos.17 and 18—in fact do suggest a physical proximity. The librarians in Muri and in Winterthur may have proceeded in the same way, listing as one bibliographical item a folder bearing on its title-page a phrase like ‘Vivaldi Concerto a 6’, but overlooking a second concerto included in it. In conclusion, we may reasonably assume that the inventory entries from Winterthur, Zurich and Muri—three towns just over 15 miles away from each other—all refer to Vivaldi’s violin concerto rv275, perhaps in conjunction with his violin concerto rv316a.

Claudio Bacciagaluppi graduated in musicology in Zurich and completed his D.Phil. in Fribourg, Switzerland, with Luca Zoppelli. He is research assistant at Fribourg University and works for the Swiss RISM office. His research fields are 18th-century Neapolitan sacred music and the circulation of music prints in the Alpine region in the 17th century. Recent papers appeared in Studi musicali (2009) and, with Janice B. Stockigt, in Fonti musicali italiane (2010). With Luigi Collarile he edited the thematic catalogue of Carlo Donato Cossoni, 1623–1700 (Berne, 2009). His dissertation was published in 2010 with the title ‘Rom, Prag, Dresden: Pergolesi und die Neapolitanische Messe in Europa’. claudio.bacciagaluppi@unifr.ch
Both historical inventories have been 
(Cambridge, MA, and London, 
(tolerance); B. J. Kaplan, 
Hundred years (St Gall, 
her kind helpfulness, 
and Michael Talbot for carefully 
one hundred and eighty years (Winterthur) for her kind helpfulness, 
results of a research project led by Luca 
This contribution draws on the first 
and Michael Talbot for carefully 
(Fehr, society, 8 
CH-W, Dep mk 90, p.89.
2. K. Nef, Die Collegia Musica in der 
first contribution on the first 
and Michael Talbot for carefully 
(Fehr, society, 8 
CH-W, Dep mk 90, p.89.
2. K. Nef, Die Collegia Musica in der 
first contribution on the first 
and Michael Talbot for carefully 
(Fehr, society, 8
Music from Oxford

Silent Music
Medieval Song and the Construction of History in Eighteenth-Century Spain

Susan Boynton, Columbia University

Silent Music provides a unique perspective on medieval liturgical music in Spain and its continued relevance in the 18th century, from political, liturgical and cultural standpoints.

256 pages | Hardback | December 2011 | 978-0-19-975459-5 | £27.50

The Flower of Paradise
Marian Devotion and Secular Song in Medieval and Renaissance Music

David J. Rothenberg, Case Western Reserve University

In spite of their widely disparate uses, Marian prayers and courtly love songs from the Middle Ages and Renaissance often show a stylistic similarity. This book examines the convergence of these two styles in polyphonic music and its broader poetic, artistic, and devotional context from ca.1200 to ca.1500.

304 pages | Hardback | October 2011 | 978-0-19-539971-4 | £22.50

Giving Voice to Love
Song and Self-Expression from the Troubadours to Guillaume de Machaut

Judith A. Peraino, Cornell University

The lyrics of medieval ‘courtly love’ songs are characteristically self-conscious. Giving Voice to Love investigates similar self-consciousness in the musical settings. Moments and examples where voice, melody, rhythm, form, and genre seem to comment on music itself tell us about musical responses to the courtly chanson tradition, and musical reflections on the complexity of self-expression.

368 pages | Hardback | January 2012 | 978-0-19-975724-4 | £30.00

For more information, contact:
Helen Boyd, Academic Marketing
Email: helen.boyd@oup.com
24-hour credit card hotline: +44 (0)1536 741727